Appendix

Period	Top articles seen	Key findings from framing analysis
Quarter 1: January – March 2020	• Growing concerns about Covid-19 globally • First suspected case in South Africa (SA), including concerns about false reports • Concerns and assurances about SA's capacity to respond • Declaration of a National State of Disaster in SA • Implementation of travel restrictions and quarantine regulations • Impact of lockdown on tourists, undocumented non-citizens, refugees and asylum seekers, workers, and internal migrants • Racism and xenophobia towards Chinese migrants • Travel restrictions • Beitbridge border fence • Impacts of lockdown on migrant groups including Zimbabweans, Mozambicans and Chinese migrants in SA, migrant workers, and travellers • Realities of migration highlighted through articles about Ethiopians found dead in a truck in Mozambique and the struggles of refugees in Cape Town	**Human interest:** weakly applied, largely no "human face" or emotional angle; broad acknowledgement of inequities & implications of lockdown and fragile health systems and economies. Where human face was present, focus on tourists, missionaries, Zimbabweans who rely on mobility as a livelihood strategy and refugees in Cape Town. **Power: Powerful** – *states/governments* to issue and implement lockdown regulations, including travel bans and build border fences; *employers/industry*; *journalists* to spread misinformation; *travel and mobility* to spread the virus and, by extension, migrants; *men* in relation to women; *churches*, ministry, and community; *bilateral and multilateral structures* to assist African states and their fragile health systems; *racism and xenophobia*; *states* abusing their power; *corruption* amongst SA political parties. **Powerless** – *fragile health systems; migrants*, including refugees and asylum seekers; *workers; women; states* unable to stop migration or to enforce public health measures **Attribution of responsibility:** *SA state* responsible for protecting women, implementing lockdown, responding to Covid-19, repatriations, abuses during enforcement of lockdown; *travellers* (tourists) and undocumented migrants responsible for spreading Covid-19; *China* responsible for failure to respond; *news outlets* and journalists for reporting; *refugee and asylum seekers* for making an area "dirty"; *employers* responsible to employees; *authorities* responsible for trying to stop migration e.g. apprehend smugglers; church responsible to communities **Economic impact:** impact on economy with focus on specific sectors – mining, textile/clothing industry; loss of livelihoods and impact thereof on migrants, individuals, and communities; Zimbabwe's reliance on SA economically; concerns about economic loss for businesses due to homeless and protesting refugees; per capita health expenditure understood to be related to fragile health systems **Conflict:** *SA government* in conflict with citizens, migrants, the media; *businesses* in conflict with refugees; *migrants* in conflict with home communities; *passengers of cruise ships/tourists* in conflict with regulations barring them from leaving vessels;

		Covid-19 in conflict with fragile health systems; *lockdown regulations* and the economy in conflict; *men and women* in conflict – gender-based violence; *everyone* in conflict with Covid-19

Moral values: moral imperative to respond to Covid-19; journalistic practices – unethical to report incorrect information; migrants framed negatively – language of "illegal" and "infected people" being responsible for bringing Covid-19 to SA; migration framed positively as an important livelihood strategy and migrants as being powerlessness as mobility is restricted; obligation to include migrants in Covid-19 response; critique of racism and xenophobia; proactive responses from African states attributed to lessons learned from Ebola; concerns about Africa – underlying assumptions about the continent brought to the fore; over-reliance on China; moral imperative on states to protect citizens and certain groups e.g. women and workers; moral imperative to "behave" – movement framed as reckless and irresponsible; importance of protecting global supply of certain metals; importance of multilateral and bilateral organisations – claims of authority and morality; role of Christianity and importance of evangelising |
| Quarter 2: April – June 2020 | • Border closures - impact on cross-border economies, businesses, truck drivers and migration routes with concerns about stranded migrants, international students, displaced populations, refugees, and asylum seekers highlighted, but also recognition that due to porous borders in the region mobility likely to continue even if borders remain closed
• Xenophobia: #SouthAfricansFirst movement emerges on social media; xenophobic violence; fake news about eSwatini citizens trying to illegally access social grants; African Youth Survey – 59% of surveyed SA youth xenophobic
• SA government's response to migrants and migration: Covid-19 described as an excuse to suspend movement including the right to claim asylum; border fence between SA and Zimbabwe being built by SA; protesting asylum seekers and refugees in CT removed by force to be reintegrated into communities; SA response to Covid-19 excludes migrants – calls for inclusion
• Repatriation of migrant workers from SA and poor quarantine conditions for returnees in home countries
• Queuing for food parcels in SA | **Human interest:** weakly applied; impact of lockdown and Covid-19 on people, and often in relation to specific communities, outlined; descriptions of poverty, specifically informal settlements create a human face; as do descriptions of the experiences of migrants in SA; impact of border closures for livelihoods and lives, including for cross-border traders, truck drivers, people in Zimbabwe; experiences of migrants and refugees globally described; experiences of miners returning to Mozambique described; incidents of xenophobia detailed; xenophobic views expressed, specifically in relation to the economy and the need to protect the economy from migrants

Power frame: *Powerful* – *Covid-19* to effect economies, industries, stop movement, exacerbate inequalities, and disrupt the status quo, Covid-19 also an opportunity for states and people; *human mobility* – to spread Covid-19, as a livelihoods strategy, to support home communities through remittances; *SA government* - to decide on and implement regulations, forcibly removing asylum seekers in CT, law enforcement – abuses of power, continued exclusion of foreigners an exercise of power, different parts of govt to undermine each other and as checks and balances (including courts), relief schemes as an exercise of benevolent power; *Governments globally* - to perpetuate human rights abuses and implement protectionist |

	- Linking of Covid-19 with mobility: concerns about migration (including returnees) bringing Covid-19 – focus on movement from SA to other SADC countries; started with rich travellers/tourists and now spreading among poorer people; additional security at SA borders; data on how Covid-19 has changed mobility; SA transport sector regulations to take precautions as mobility spreads Covid-19 - Details of humanitarian organisation and UN agency work - Repatriation of Ethiopians who survived and did not die in Mozambique - Romanticisation of refugees and "communities" - Impact of Covid-19 and lockdown on mining sector	approaches to migration; *Zimbabwean government* - to co-ordinate return of citizens and support; *Humanitarian organisations and UN agencies* – importance of their work for vulnerable communities in Southern Africa; *Charity/ people helping each other/community; Non-citizens* portrayed as powerful and destructive, SA government encouraged to exercise power and exclude them; *landlords and employers* powerful in relation to migrants; exercises of power/agency in relation to border management. **Powerless** - *migrants* both in SA and globally; efforts to control migration in SA; *governments and local infrastructure* powerless in implementing Covid-19 response; *regional economic communities* (RECs); *South Africans* powerless in response to foreigners; *vulnerable groups* in society bear the brunt of Covid-19 including sex workers, artisanal small-scale miners trapped underground, and children

| | | **Attribution of responsibility:** *Covid-19* responsible for position within which many businesses find themselves, decrease in human mobility, exacerbating existing challenges/inequalities, "covidisation" of healthcare; travel restrictions and lockdowns responsible for increased vulnerability of migrant and mobile populations; church has a responsibility towards those in need; *SA government* responsible for responses to Covid-19, the enforcement of regulations/law and abuses of power by law enforcement, failing to take responsibility and think of businesses, spreading xenophobia, inequalities that are being exacerbated by Covid-19, protecting the vulnerable – which they are largely failing to do, the exclusion of non-nationals from Covid-19 responses, good governance, deportations, allowing foreigners into the country; *Courts* responsible for state oversight; *mining companies* Covid-19 regulation compliance of returning miners and ensuring their own profit margins; *governments in general* responsible for responses to Covid-19 and their potential failings, for (not) including migrants in Covid-19 responses, have a responsibility to take advantage of the opportunities provided by Covid-19; *SADC members states* responsible for regional co-operation (and lack thereof), failing to meet their responsibilities in relation to both Covid-19 and basic good governance; *Zimbabwean government* taking responsibility for citizens through repatriations; *travellers and tourists* responsible for the spread of Covid-19; c*ross-border migrants* responsible for destroying the fence between SA and Zimbabwe; *humanitarian organisations* responsible for good work being done/looking after the vulnerable

Economic frame: recession/economic impact of Covid-19 in SA and globally; loss of profit for business and industries; loss of livelihoods and income for individuals and resulting food insecurity, evictions, loss of remittances; Social Relief of Distress (SRD) grant providing financial support to those in need; economic inequities exacerbated by Covid-19; wasteful expenditure/corruption by SA government; economic factors acknowledged as drivers of migration; cost of education; non-citizens linked to unemployment in SA

Conflict frame: *states* globally in conflict with their citizens and with migrants and human mobility more broadly; *SA government* in conflict with human rights, civil society, through implementation of regulations seen as being in conflict with specific kinds of livelihoods e.g. informal and cross-border livelihoods; *migrants* in conflict with host/home communities, landlords, smugglers; *business/industry* in |

		conflict with Covid-19, government, migrant workers; *Covid-19* in conflict with communities, people and states, business and industry, global economy; member states v SADC; SA as an unequal society in conflict with itself
		Moral values: sympathetic to migrants – migrants must be included in Covid-19 responses by states, romanticisation of refugees; critiques of xenophobia, specifically use of xenophobia by the state; cross-border mobility - responsible for the spread of Covid-19, "illegal" migrants portrayed as a Covid-19 risk; cross-border mobility of goods and people vital for livelihoods and local economies; articles explicitly discouraging migration – migration portrayed as dangerous; failures of governance as lockdown was not developed with the poor and vulnerable in mind – moral imperative of looking after those members of society who need it; Covid-19 fuelling state violence and authoritarianism; state incompetence globally highlighted; critiques of unequal societies and communities – specifically SA; nationalism; regionalism and bilateral co-operation important; benevolence of the SA government in setting up the SRD grant; need for govt and civil society to work together in the fight against Covid-19; importance of community, coming together and helping each other; Covid-19 providing an opportunity that should be seized; concerns about "Africa" – fragile health systems, lack of capacity, lockdowns not necessarily the most appropriate response
Quarter 3: July – September 2020	• Critique of travel bans and effects of border closures on people, communities, countries, including decreases in remittances from diaspora communities to home countries; development of new (often more dangerous) routes due to travel restrictions; and delays at border between SA and Zimbabwe due to poorly implemented Covid-19 regulations on Zimbabwe side • Globally, governments are making asylum seeking more difficult • Appropriateness of responses to Covid-19 in SA questioned/critique of SA's response • Roll out of the SRD grant in SA, including problems with this process and the inclusion of non-citizens • Concerns about a second wave in SA • UN and humanitarian organisations' work publicised • SA government's response to migrants and migration: protesting refugees in CT in camps – conditions not great, being told to either reintegrate into communities or be repatriated;	**Human interest frame**: acknowledgement of the effects of Covid-19 globally on different populations, but limited emotional angle or human face; impact of border closures on various groups; effects of Covid-19 and responses to Covid-19 on different industries and sectors; impact of legislative and policy changes on asylum seekers and refugees; impact of xenophobia on migrant and mobile populations; exacerbation of existing socio-economic challenges in Africa; positive impact SA could have on lives of Zimbabweans

	amendments to the Refugees Act bring more restrictions to the asylum application process • Ways in which Covid-19 is exacerbating inequalities and vulnerabilities in SA, including those related to migrant status • Concerns about changing dynamics in poaching due to covid and how this will affect endangered animals. • Call for Covid-19 testing materials, treatments, and vaccines to be available globally	**Power frame:** *Powerful* - *governments and law enforcement; regional bodies* – both powerful and powerless; power of *mobility* – power and importance of cross-border mobility in the region; power of travel restrictions on the lives of those living close to borders/ who cross borders regularly; power of human mobility to spread Covid-19; *Cross-border Traders' Association in Zimbabwe; Covid-19*; importance and power of *UN apparatus*; power of *HICs* to exclude/ forget about LMICs; *xenophobia* powerful in the lives of migrants; *"illegal migrants"* in SA are powerful and have an economic cost for SA; *the wealthy* to migrate and move as they please; *civil society* in SA; *smugglers* – powerful in their ability to move people and things. **Powerless** - *refugees, asylum seekers and migrants*; powerlessness of *many in SA* to protect themselves from Covid-19; *conservation efforts* and endangered wildlife; the *trucking industry* in the face of an economic recession, border closures and xenophobic violence; powerlessness of *closing borders* in some sense as people are still crossing the border; powerlessness of the *African continent* **Attribution of responsibility:** *SA government* responsible for perpetuating xenophobia, lockdown and effects of regulations on individuals and industries, failing to take responsibility for migrant communities, failing to take responsibility and deal decisively with the pandemic, for protecting citizens from non-citizens, specifically economically, need to take some responsibility and help Zimbabwean citizens; *Covid-19* responsible for economic recession, food insecurity and rising poverty, responsible for changes to higher education and student experiences – universities need to take responsibility to internationalise; *UN agencies* have a responsibility towards the poor and vulnerable; *cross-border mobility* responsible for the spread of Covid-19; *governments and policy makers* globally responsible for responding to Covid-19, failing to take responsibility for asylum seekers and refugees; *African governments* responsible for the inability to know the full Covid-19 picture on the continent, SADC and governments need to harmonise regional systems, government lockdowns responsible for tourism industry struggles in Africa, corruption, poor governance and development; Zimbabwean government/ZANU PF responsible for the situation in which Zimbabwe finds itself; *non-state actors* are taking on responsibility for migrant and mobile populations, including businesses and civil society organisations; *lockdowns* responsible for worse position within which refugee girls and women find themselves globally; *South African community* for xenophobic violence

		Economic frame: unemployment, loss of income and livelihoods, poverty; loss of profit for industries and sectors; SA's "deteriorating economy" given as a reason for lockdown restrictions easing; acknowledgement of the economic drivers/push factors of migration, including of the wealthy; broader economic impact of the pandemic globally; xenophobic ideas about the economic effect of migrants; changes to ways in which people are remitting

Conflict frame: *SA government* in conflict with Covid-19, cross-border mobility and cross-border traders, industries, including mining and the taxi industry, citizens, migrants, humanitarian organisations and civil society; *South Africans* in conflict with non-citizens; non-citizen truck drivers; acrimonious behaviour between various countries and regions, e.g. countries with low rates of infection in conflict with those with high rates of infection around travel restrictions; *trucking industry* in conflict with states and travel restrictions; *governments globally* in conflict with their citizens, international students, refugees

Moral values: importance of UN systems and agencies and the global security agenda; racism needs to be resisted and understood to be part of global structures; explicit argument that state support must be provided to those in need, including migrants; importance of responding to Covid-19, including through lockdowns; mobility and migration central in people's lives; sympathetic to refugees, critical of SA xenophobia; SA government has failed its citizens – non-citizens take jobs that are meant for South Africans, wealthy South Africans have been failed by the state and are migrating as a result; both the Zimbabwean and SA governments have failed Zimbabwean citizens; technologically driven ways of doing things are needed in SA |
| Quarter 4: October – December 2020 | • Travel restrictions and border closures: implications of restrictions and regulations at Beitbridge border post between SA and Zimbabwe, including the death of 15 people; 14 officials face disciplinary charges after border fence breached in over 100 places
• Requirements for Covid-19 certificates to travel
• Ways in which various migrants continue to enter or leave or move within SA
• Continued stand-off between refugees in CT and authorities | **Human interest frame:** impact of Covid-19 and Covid-19 responses on migrant and mobile populations – very limited use of human face; impact of the (mis)management of the Beit Bridge border and border closures; implications of xenophobia on migrants; individual "hero" stories told as inspiration; impact of SA government and society failures on vulnerable groups; Zimbabwean government failures and implications thereof on Zimbabwean nationals |

	• Extension of SRD grant to include some migrants • Challenges faced by asylum seekers, refugees, and migrants in SA, including increase in xenophobia, resulting in policy proposals to limit access for non-nationals to the economy • Xenophobic calls for SA businesses and society to exclude non-citizens • Digital solutions to remittances proposed • Impact of Covid-19 on continuity of TB care, specifically for miners who returned home to Eswatini and lost access to treatment • Wealthy South Africans looking to migrate	**Power frame:** *Powerful* - *Covid-19; SA government; business/industry; civil society; states* have the power to arbitrarily impose lockdowns and regulations and undermine regional and global collaboration; *individual "heros"; UN system; charity; cross-border mobility* – important and powerful in the lives of those whose livelihoods and access to food and goods depend on it; *xenophobia; non-citizens* in the SA economy. ***Powerless*** - migrants, refugees, and asylum seekers; powerlessness of those who bear the brunt of inequalities exacerbated by the pandemic; governments due to budget cuts and Covid-19; SA citizens to access the economy due to foreigners **Attribution of responsibility:** *Covid-19* responsible for highlighting the socio-economic status of poor South Africans, further marginalisation of the poor, loss of jobs and livelihoods, xenophobic tensions, choices to migrate; *SA government* responsible for additional precarity and vulnerability experienced by the poor and marginalised in SA, including migrants and asylum seekers, poor migration policy and responses; *UN agencies* responsible for helping vulnerable migrants, promoting gender equity; *governments globally* responsible for the continued use and mismanagement of border closures; *cross-border mobility* responsible for undermining SA's responses to Covid-19; *regulations* responsible for delays at border crossings; *individuals and communities* responsible for following, or failing to follow, regulations and social distancing **Economic frame:** loss of livelihoods, food insecurity; cost of Covid-19 testing/ "certificates" high; economic impact of the pandemic is aggravating xenophobic tensions; economic factors underpinning choices to migrate; economic inequities in SA exacerbated by pandemic; recession, broad economic impact of the pandemic; economic impact of Covid-19 and lockdowns on industries **Conflict frame:** *Governments*, particularly SA government, in conflict with Covid-19, citizens, industry, including multinational pharmaceutical companies, migrant and mobile populations, including travellers and tourists, NGOs, humanitarian orgs, social media, journalists, UN agencies, including the World Trade Organization (WTO) and World Health Organization (WHO), developed states in conflict with developing states in terms of global co-operation and the politics involved in securing vaccines; *migrants* in conflict with South Africans, home

		communities when they return from SA, United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR); *societies* broadly in conflict **Moral values:** sympathetic towards migrants - critical of xenophobia and SA government's failure to include migrant and mobile populations in responses, recognition of the rights of migrants; critique of border management, specifically between SA and Zimbabwe; critical of SA government's responses to the pandemic and to migration; importance of responding to Covid-19; xenophobic - economy needs to be protected for South Africans, use of "illegal" referring to undocumented entry; importance of bilateralism and multilaterism, particularly the UN system; recognition of the work that ordinary individuals are doing in their communities as response to Covid-19; critical of industry – corruption and callousness displayed towards workers