

Supplementary Material 1. Comparison of the Rules of Procedure (RoP) in local Polish Citizens' Assemblies (CAs) 2016-2023.

Variables (primary set of object variables is written in italics)	I Gdańsk CA (2016)	II Gdańsk CA (2017)	III Gdańsk CA (2017)	Lublin CA (2018)	Wrocław CA (2020)	Warsaw CA (2020)	Poznań CA (2021)	I Krakow CA (X 2021)	II Krakow CA (III 2023)	Rzeszów CA (2023)
FORMAL VARIABLES										
Form	An appendix to the Presidential Ordinance	An appendix to the Presidential Ordinance	An appendix to the Presidential Ordinance	A few different files called “guidebooks” (for participants, experts, stakeholders etc.)	Stand- alone document	Stand- alone document	Stand-alone document	Stand- alone document	Stand- alone document	Stand-alone document
Preamble						Yes		Yes	Yes	
Definitions					Yes	Yes		Yes	Yes	Yes
Good practices					Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Appendices									Yes	Yes
OBJECT VARIABLES										
Purpose										
<i>The guiding question of a CA</i>				Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
<i>Specific questions</i>					Yes		Yes		Yes	
Accountability										
<i>Binding character of the CA's</i>				Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

<i>recommendations</i>										
Transparency										
Educational part of the CA is available to the public				Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Representativeness										
<i>Description of the draw (random sampling)</i>		Yes	Yes	Yes (detailed)	Yes (detailed)		Yes			
Demographic criteria	District, gender, age and education	District, gender, age and education	District, gender, age and education	Gender, age, district and education	Gender, age, education, district, the most frequently used mode of transport	Gender, age, education and district	Gender, age, education, approach to the climate change and district	Gender, age, district and education	Gender, age, district and education	Gender, age, district and education
The number of the panelists from each district	Yes (depends on the number of residents in each district)	Yes (depends on the number of residents in each district)	Yes (depends on the number of residents in each district)	Yes (proportionally to the percentage proportion of each district in the whole number of residents)	Yes (according to the algorithm)		Yes (according to the algorithm)			
Minimum age of the panelists		18 years	18 years	18 years	18 years	15 years	18 years	18 years	15 years	15 years
Inclusiveness										
<i>Stakeholders</i>				Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
The selection of the Stakeholders				Everyone can apply	Invitation from the Coordinating Team	Everyone can apply (but there may be limits)	Coordinating Team prepares a list of identified	Operator prepares a list of identified Stakeholders	Operator prepares a list of identified Stakeholders	Coordinating Team prepares a list of criteria for the

							Stakeholders who are invited and there is an additional open call	rs who are invited and there is an additional open call	rs who are invited and there is an additional open call	selection of Stakeholders and selects them in an open call (in cooperation with the City Hall)
Time for Stakeholders' speeches				8 minutes	6-8 minutes		6-8 minutes			
<i>Formulation of recommendations' proposals by the Stakeholders</i>				Yes				Yes		
Remuneration for the panelists			Yes (amount)	Yes	Yes	Yes (amount)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes (amount)
Information										
<i>Experts</i>		Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Tasks/rights			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - transfer of knowledge, - preparing a summary of a presentation, - answering panelists' questions 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - preparing a presentation on the CA's topic, - formulating and commenting on recommendations, - preparing written educational materials for panelists and a summary of a presentation 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - preparing a presentation on the CA's topic, - formulating and commenting on recommendations, - preparing materials including a summary of a presentation 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - participating in CA's meetings, - preparing a presentation on the CA's topic and answering questions asked by panelists, - preparing materials including a summary of a presentation 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - preparing a presentation on the CA's topic, - preparing materials including a summary of a presentation and recommendation, - preparing additional educational materials for panelists 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - preparing a presentation on the CA's topic, - answering questions asked by the panelists, - preparing materials including a summary of a presentation, recommendation, 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - preparing a presentation on the CA's topic, - answering questions asked by the panelists, - preparing materials including a summary of a presentation, recommendation, 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - preparing a presentation on the CA's topic, - answering questions asked by the panelists, - preparing materials including a summary of a presentation, recommendation and answers on questions

Experts/Stake holders										
Panelists have a right to organize an additional meeting or extend a session				Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes			
Group deliberation										
<i>Facilitators/ Moderators</i>	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Reserve group (+ rules of its selection and its participation in the CA)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Final wording of recommendations				Yes	Yes	Yes (Coordinating Team)	Yes (Panelists with assistance from a professional editor, if necessary)	Yes (Operator)	Yes (Operator)	Yes (Coordinating Team)
Probationary voting				Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Time										
<i>Duration of a CA</i>					Yes (1+1+1+1+1+1)	Yes (2+2)		Yes (1+1+1+1+1+1)	Yes (2+2+1)	Yes (2+2+1)
Integrity										
<i>Operator/ Organizer</i>			Yes (experts for CA's organization)					Yes (in cooperation with the City Hall)	Yes (in cooperation with the City Hall)	Yes
Composition								NGO	Two NGOs	Two NGOs (a consortium)

Rights			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - selection of experts, - inviting additional experts and organization of their speeches - selection of a voting method 					<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - organization of the CA's proceedings, - grouping the proposals of recommendations if they are similar, - verifying the proposals of recommendations on their compliance with the CA's aim and topic and the City Hall's competences, - editing the recommendations in a transparent way, - selection of the voting method, - appointing 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - appointing additional consultants 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - establishing precise rules of Stakeholders' participation, - ensuring facilitation of the discussions, - organizational and substantive preparation of the CA through the Coordinating Team - preparing a final report
--------	--	--	---	--	--	--	--	--	---	---

								additional consultant s		
<i>Coordinating team</i>	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes			Yes
Composition				A list with names (2 persons)	A list with names (4 persons)	representat ives of NGOs responsible for a CA's preparation	A list with names (3 persons)			representativ es of NGOs responsible for a CA's preparation (Operators)
Rights	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - coordiantion of the consultations, - preparation of a partial report from the consultations, - ensuring the moderator, - preparation of demographic criteria for the draw of panelists and conducting the draw, - inviting experts, - selection a voting method 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - coordiantion of the consultations, - preparation of a partial report from the consultations, - inviting panelists, Experts and organizations that are interested in the CA's topic, - selection a voting method 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - preparation of the draw procedure, - consultation s on the selection of a voting method 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - organization of speeches of additional experts, - contact with Experts and Stakeholders between sessions, - verifying if recommendations correspond with the topic of a CA, - asking fact-checkers to verify information presented during discussions, - preparation of a CA's programme 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - coordinatin g each stage of the CA, - conducting a draw of panelists, - organizing a call for Stakeholde rs, - selection of Experts and Facilitators, - preparing a CA's programme , - organizatio n of CA's meetings, - conducting the final voting on 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - informing the general public about the CA's proceedings, - collects CA-related opinions and ideas, - technical support for panelists, - coordinatin g each stage of the CA, - conducting a draw of panelists, - organizing a call for Stakeholde rs, 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - designing the CA and coordinating its proceedings, - conducting a draw of panelists, - organizing a call for Stakeholders , - selecting Experts and Facilitators, - preparing a CA's programme, - organization of CA's meetings, - facilitating discussions and conducting the final voting on 			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - ensuring facilitation of the discussions, - developing templates and deadlines for recommendations, - collecting proposals of recommendations and circulating them among the panelists, - grouping the proposals of recommendations if they are similar, - verifying the proposals of recommendations on their compliance with the CA's aim and topic

					<p>recommendations, - updating information on CA's proceedings on the CA's website</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - organization of CA's meetings, - conducting the final voting on recommendations, - preparing promotional campaign of the CA, - preparing a final report from the CA - participating in meetings of the Monitoring Team 	<p>recommendations, - updating information on CA's proceedings on the CA's website,</p> <p>- preparing a final report from the CA,</p> <p>- preparation of the arbitration procedure,</p> <p>- a right to stop a Stakeholder's presentation if the rules of procedure were broken</p>			<p>and the City Hall's competences and removing the non-compliant ones,</p> <p>- editing the recommendations in a transparent way,</p> <p>- selection of the voting method (in cooperation with the City Hall and the Monitoring Team),</p> <p>- organizing a call for Stakeholders , Experts and Observers and their selection (in cooperation with the City Hall),</p> <p>- conducting the final voting,</p> <p>- participating in meetings of the Monitoring Team</p>
--	--	--	--	--	--	--	---	--	--	--

Monitoring team				Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Composition					Representatives of the City Hall (5 persons), the City Council (1 person from each Club), NGOs/informal groups (9 persons)	Representatives of the City Hall and the President, the City Council and NGOs/informal groups (10 persons)	Representatives of the City Hall and the Mayor (4 persons), the City Council (the number is dependent on how numerous is a political party), academics (4 persons) and NGOs/informal groups (8 persons)	Representatives of the City Council (1 person from each political party), academics (6 persons) and NGOs/informal groups (6 persons)	Representatives of the City Council (5 persons), City Hall (5 persons), academics (4 persons) and NGOs/informal groups (4 persons)	The Monitoring Team acts on the basis of the Mayor's Ordinance no. 0050/411/2023 from 12 September 2023
Rights					<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - monitoring the CA's proceedings, - pointing out Observers who can attend deliberative meetings; verifying a CA's programme ; - collecting comments regarding the breach of the standards, 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - approving the rules of procedure and decisions of a CA (particularly those related to public campaign, the draw of panelists and selection of Experts), - approving the recommendations on their compliance with Warsaw strategic 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - submitting comments and amendments to a CA's Rules of Procedure, - monitoring the CA's proceedings on its complying with Rules of Procedure, - participating in CA's proceedings, - collecting comments regarding the breach of the standards 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - approving the rules of procedure, - collecting comments regarding the breach of the standards, - calling the Coordinating Team to restore the CA's proceedings according to the RoP, - monitoring the draw of panelists, the selection of 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - approving the rules of procedure, - collecting comments regarding the breach of the standards, - calling the Coordinating Team to restore the CA's proceedings according to the RoP, - monitoring the draw of panelists, the selection of 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - approving the rules of procedure, - collecting comments regarding the breach of the standards, - calling the Coordinating Team to restore the CA's proceedings according to the RoP, - monitoring the draw of panelists, the selection of

					<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - calling the Coordinating Team to restore the CA's proceedings according to the RoP, - investigating appeals related to the rejection of Stakeholders, - participating in inaugural and educational CA's meetings, - initiating of an arbitration procedure 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> documents and feasibility - collecting comments regarding the breach of the standards, - calling the Coordinating Team to restore the CA's proceedings according to the RoP, - investigating appeals related to the rejection of Stakeholders - participating in public sessions of the CA 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> during CA's meetings, - calling the Coordinating Team to restore the CA's proceedings according to the RoP, if necessary - initiating of an arbitration procedures, if necessary, - monitoring the draw of panelists, - resolving issues related to the participation of Stakeholders , - selecting Observers eligible for attending the deliberative part of the CA, - addressing requests for excluding a panelist, if necessary 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Experts, addressing the Stakeholders' requests and voting on recommendations, - a right to prepare an evaluation report, - indicating its own observers attending the CA's meetings, - formulating the proposals of amendment of the CA's proceedings, including the amendments of the Rules of Procedure, 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Experts, addressing the Stakeholders' and Observers' requests and voting on recommendations, - a right to prepare an evaluation report, - indicating its own observers attending the CA's meetings, - formulating the proposals of amendment of the CA's proceedings, including the amendments of the Rules of Procedure, - commenting on the proposals of 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> tions and final report, - accepting changes in the CA's programme, - commenting on the proposals of recommendations with regard to their compliance with the City Hall's competences
--	--	--	--	--	---	--	--	---	--	--

[illegible]

Deliberative part is secret				Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Evaluation										
Final report	<p>The Coordinating Team prepares a partial report from the consultations that should be publicly available</p> <p>The result of the final vote must be determined as soon as possible and information about the result of the final voting must be published within seven days after the CA had ended</p>	<p>The Coordinating Team prepares a partial report from the consultations that should be publicly available</p> <p>Information about the result of the final voting must be published within seven days after the CA had ended</p>	Recommendations of a CA must be published within 30 days after the CA had ended	<p>A list of proposals of recommendations together with their final support by the panelists (expressed as percentage) is published on the official CA's website as soon as possible after the presentation of recommendations</p>	The Coordinating Team prepares the report (approved by the Monitoring Team)	<p>The Coordinating Team prepares the report, A list of proposals of recommendations together with their final support by the panelists (expressed as percentage) is published on the official CA's website after the official presentation of recommendations</p>	<p>The final result of the final voting is determined as soon as possible after its end, but not later than within 7 days from the final voting</p> <p>The Monitoring Team can prepare an evaluation report</p>	<p>The final result of the final voting is published on the CA's website as soon as possible, but not later than within 14 days from the final voting</p>	<p>The final result of the final voting is published on the CA's website as soon as possible, but not later than within 14 days from the final voting</p> <p>The Operator presents the final report approved by the Monitoring Team</p>	<p>A list of proposals of recommendations together with their final support by the panelists (expressed as percentage) is published on the official CA's website as soon as possible after the presentation of recommendations</p>
Innovations										
The rules that appeared maximum two times			Fact-checkers	Fact-checkers	The right of the panelists to formulate a request to dismiss a facilitator or a moderator	Inviting substantive advisors	<p>Recording the meetings of the Monitoring Team</p> <p>Observers can attend only</p>	Acceptance of the composition of the Monitoring Team by the Mayor	The selection of Experts and Observers is made by the Operator in cooperation	The selection of Experts and Observers is made by the Operator in cooperation with the City Hall

							<p>educational part of a CA</p> <p>An institution of a witness</p> <p>Appeals from a decision on excluding an observer shall be resolved by the Department of Political Systems</p> <p>An additional criterion for binding character of CA's recommendation, that is, the strength of its support measured by the attitude of participants</p> <p>A right to appeal from the result of the final voting on recommendations, if a breach of rules is suspected</p> <p>Programme-related meetings</p>	<p>Information about the breach of the RoPs (confirmed by the Monitoring Team) is published on the CA's website and in the final report</p>	<p>n with the City Hall</p> <p>A possibility to pay the panelists with the use of vouchers</p> <p>An obligation of the organizer to obtain an approval of the RoP from the Monitoring Team</p>	<p>The selection of Stakeholders is made by the Operator in cooperation with the City Hall</p> <p>A rule that photo services are ensured by the City Hall</p> <p>A rule that the Mayor convenes the first meeting of the Monitoring Team</p>
--	--	--	--	--	--	--	---	---	--	--

							between Stakeholders and Coordinating Team are recorded			
--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--

Note: Authors' own elaboration based on the OECD good practices for Climate Assemblies (2021) and KNOCA Evaluation Framework (Carrick, 2022).