

Green and Digital Justice Analytical Framework & Coding Results

Green justice

Green justice

Name	Description	Files
Distributive justice		26
Distributive measures	Stipulation of measures to more equitably distribute the costs and benefits and the twin transformations.	26
Ambivalent distribution		7
Cashless payment (ambivalent)		1
Education & capacity-building (ambivalent)		5
Financial instruments (ambivalent)		2
Regulatory & legal requirements		1
Distribution of benefits		23

Name	Description	Files
Community-based solutions (benefits)		4
Educational and capacity-building measures	Measures to improve people's readiness to derive transformational benefits	18
Education (benefits)		9
Science & technology development (benefits))		1
Technical support & capacity-building (benefits)		16
Behavioral nudges		2
Financial & market instruments		13
Financial aid & tax exemption (benefits)		8
Green public procurement		7

Name	Description	Files
Green & Digital Jobs (benefits)		3
job creation		3
Job retraining		2
Provision of public services		5
Digital public services (benefits)		1
E-education platforms (benefits)		0
e-government (benefits)		1
e-healthcare platforms (benefits)		0
e-identity (benefits)		0
Public transport		4

Name	Description	Files
Distribution of losses		6
Educational & capacity-building measures (losses)		1
farming (losses)		1
Financial aid & tax exemptions (losses)		3
Green & Digital jobs (losses)		4
None (how to distribute)		3
Distributive targets	Identification of the recipients of the benefits and costs	26
Ambivalent loss-benefit	This category applies mostly to cases where the government decides to support citizens in coping with new regulations that it just impose on them: it is framed as a free/discounted public service, but in fact serves to mitigate the impact of new burden. For example, promising free waste sorting items in a law that intrroduces sorting requirements. QD1813: gives the people many benefits but real goal is to promote digital economy.The narrative is typically one of 'both rights and duties' (quyền và nghĩa vụ).	7
Individual citizens (ambivalent)		5

Name	Description	Files
Students (ambivalent)		2
Distribution of benefits		23
Business actors		16
Waste management industry		1
farmers		2
Skilled groups		4
Green industry talents		1
Healthcare personnel (benefits)		1
Young professionals, teachers, students		2
Spatial groups		3
Local communities (benefits)		1
Rural regions (who benefits)		1

Name	Description	Files
urban regions (distributed among whom)		1
Students (benefits)		3
Whole of society		18
Workers (benefits)		1
Distribution of losses	Actors in this group are explicitly recognized as being disproportionately affected by the transitions. In other words, this is about rectifying the distribution of losses.	6
Business actors (losses)		0
environmentally vulnerable segments		1
Ethnic minorities		1
poor people		2
rural regions (losses)		1
The elderly		1
Vulnerable businesses		1

Name	Description	Files
women (distributed among whom)		1
Workers		2
none (distribute among whom)		3
Intersectionality issue		5
Procedural justice		26
How to participate	Stipulation of participation methods (consultation; opinion gathering; information transparency; co-design; co-implementation; etc.)	26
Identified procedural rights		17
Access to legal process		4
Supervision and evaluation		4
Informational measures		16
Participation in decisionmaking process		4
Co-implementation (generic)		1

Name	Description	Files
Become leaders		0
Collection of own data		0
Consultation, dialogue, and proposal		3
Social dialogue & forum		1
None (how to participate)		9
Who participates	Identification of social groups to participate in decisionmaking and implementation of green and digital transformation, preferably those traditionally excluded. Who participates is much less precise than distributed among whom, many of the former simply states 'the people' or 'the community'. Moreover, more than half of files have no participating subjects (higher than the 'none' value for how to participate); suggesting that mere slogans are more prevalent than substance.	26
Identified participants		18
Business actors		9
Farmers		1

Name	Description	Files
Farmers - crafts villagers - rural dwellers		1
Individual citizens		15
local communities		2
NGOs		3
Vulnerable groups		3
ethnic minorities		1
Poor people		1
The elderly		1
Women		1
workers (participants)		1
Young professionals, teachers, students (participants)		1
None (who to participate)		9

Name	Description	Files
Recognition justice	Recognizing adverse impacts on the cultural values and/or livelihoods of vulnerable communities and identifying such groups,	26
Framing of the transitions	Framing of environmental/digital justice: utilitarian (e.g., monetary, efficiency) or holistic (e.g., human health, social cohesion)? In other words, the conditions under which participation takes place (Langemeyer & Connolly, 2020).	26
Civic environmentalism		5
Radical civic environmentalism		0
Reformist civic environmentalism		5
Ecological modernization		3
Strong ecological modernization		0
Weak ecological modernization		3
Green governmentality		16
Elitist green governmentality		10

Name	Description	Files
Reflexive green governmentality		6
no framing		2
Which needs and values are impacted	Identification of potential impacts of climate mitigation and digitalization on both lifestyle/cultures and livelihoods(i.e. job loss due to coal phaseout, data theft, lifestyle changes; etc). This can refer to both recognition of adverse impacts to be avoided AND positive impacts that should be promoted for certain communities	26
Misrecognition		6
Cultural values (undefined)		2
Burial practices		1
Travel right (Misrecognition)		4
Nonrecognition		8
No recognition		8
Recognition of needs and values		13

Name	Description	Files
cultural values (inclusive)		3
Energy security		2
access to renewable energy electricity		1
Reasonable electricity price		1
Food security		3
Agriculture security		1
Healthcare		1
Income security & consumer rights		3
Free service fee using the natural ecosystem		1
Jobs		4
Mobility rights (recognized)	This is recognized because it enhances people's mobility through public transport policies, rather than confining them to specific means of transport	1

Name	Description	Files
Social security & financial aid		3
Financial aid		1
general plight of vulnerable groups		2
Whose needs and values are recognized	Identification of particularly vulnerable communities, whose livelihoods and cultural values maybe affected.	26
Consumers		1
Ethnic minorities		4
Farmers		1
Indigenous communities		1
No recognition		8
Religious people		1
Specific regions	Geographic, not individual targets	12
Climate vulnerable regions		7
Rural regions		4

Name	Description	Files
Urban regions		2
The people in general		5
Vulnerable groups (recognition)		4
low income households		2
People loss of civil capacity		1
People under social protection		0
persons with cognitive or behavioral difficulties		0
persons with lost or limited legal capacity		1
Women		3
Youth,students		2

Digital justice

Name	Description	Files
Distributive justice		21
Distributive measures	Stipulation of measures to more equitably distribute the costs and benefits and the twin transformations.	21
Ambivalent distribution		8
Database access (ambivalent)		4
Privacy safeguarding (ambivalent)		2
Digital economy		2
Cashless payment (ambivalent)		2
digital banking (ambivalent)		1
Digital public services (ambivalent)		3

Name	Description	Files
Digital public service (ambivalent)		1
Education (ambivalent)		2
Distribution of benefits		18
Digital economy benefits		5
cashless payment (benefits)		2
E-commerce platforms (benefits)		3
Digital public services (benefits)		11
digital banking (benefits)		1
e-government (benefits)		9
e-identity (benefits)		3
social security (e-government benefits)		1

Name	Description	Files
Educational and capacity measures (losses)		11
Cybersecurity skills (benefits)		3
Technical support & capacity-building (benefits)		8
E-social services	Including healthcare and education	6
Education (benefits)	Provision of digitalized/virtual education, not education or training to improve digital skills (which goes to capacity-building).	5
E-education platforms (benefits)		4
e-healthcare platforms (benefits)		4
Financial aid & tax exemption (benefits)		4
Green & Digital Jobs (benefits)		4
job creation		1

Name	Description	Files
Job retraining		3
Legal safeguarding		1
Virtual databases access-protection (benefits)	Right of citizens to access national databases and have their own data protected	5
Distribution of losses		3
Digital public services (losses)		1
Green & Digital jobs (losses)		1
Policy evaluation (losses)		1
Technical capacity & educational measures		1
None (how to distribute)		0
Distributive targets	Identification of the recipients of the benefits and costs	21
Ambivalent loss-benefit	This category applies mostly to cases where the government decides to support citizens in coping with new regulations that it just impose on them: it is framed as a free/discounted public service, but in fact serves to mitigate the impact of new burden. For example, promising free waste sorting items in a law that introduces sorting requirements. QD1813: gives the people many benefits but real goal	7

Name	Description	Files
	is to promote digital economy.The narrative is typically one of 'both rights and duties' (quyền và nghĩa vụ).	
individual citizens (ambivalent)		6
Individual ICT user (ambivalent)		3
private sector companies (ambivalent)		2
Distribution of benefits		18
Business actors		9
Digital industry companies		2
Individual citizens		15
Individual ICT user		5
Skilled groups		5
Digital Professionals		3
digital talents		2

Name	Description	Files
R&D actors		2
Social services recipients		2
Hospitals, med centers		1
Medical patients (benefit recipient)		1
social security recipients (benefits)		1
Students (benefits)		3
Whole of society		9
General beneficiaries		1
Distribution of losses	Actors in this group are explicitly recognized as being disproportionately affected by the transitions. In other words, this is about rectifying the distribution of losses.	3
Ethnic minorities		1
Whole of society (losses)		1
Workers		1

Name	Description	Files
none (distribute among whom)		0
Intersectionality issue		1
Intersectionality (lack of)		1
Procedural justice		21
How to participate	Stipulation of participation methods (consultation; opinion gathering; information transparency; co-design; co-implementation; etc.)	21
Identified procedural rights		14
Access to legal process		3
Supervision and evaluation		3
Informational measures		12
Participation in decision-making process		4
Co-implementation		2
Consultation, dialogue, and proposal		2

Name	Description	Files
Social dialogue & forum		1
None (how to participate)		7
Who participates	Identification of social groups to participate in decisionmaking and implementation of green and digital transformation, preferably those traditionally excluded. Who participates is much less precise than distributed among whom, many of the former simply states 'the people' or 'the community'. Moreover, more than half of files have no participating subjects (higher than the 'none' value for how to participate); suggesting that mere slogans are more prevalent than substance.	21
Identified participants		14
Digital talents (participants)		1
Farmers		0
Farmers - crafts villagers - rural dwellers		0
Individual citizens		11
local communities		0

Name	Description	Files
NGOs		0
Private sectors		7
Vulnerable groups		0
ethnic minorities		0
Poor people		0
The elderly		0
Women		0
workers (participants)		1
Young professionals, teachers, students (participants)		1
None (who to participate)		7
Recognition justice	Recognizing adverse impacts on the cultural values and/or livelihoods of vulnerable communities and identifying such groups,	21
Framing of the transitions	Framing of environmental/digital justice: utilitarian (e.g., monetary, efficiency) or holistic (e.g., human health, social cohesion)? In other words, the conditions under which participation takes place (Langemeyer & Connolly, 2020).	21

Name	Description	Files
Civic digital transformation		0
Radical civic digital transformation		0
Reformist Civic digital transformation		0
Digital governmentality		14
Elitist digital governmentality		5
Commodification of data		2
Reflexive digital governmentality		9
Digital modernization		7
Strong digital modernization		5
Weak digital modernization		2
no framing		0

Name	Description	Files
Which needs and values are impacted	Identification of potential impacts of climate mitigation and digitalization on both lifestyle/cultures and livelihoods(i.e. job loss due to coal phaseout, data theft, lifestyle changes; etc). This can refer to both recognition of adverse impacts to be avoided AND positive impacts that should be promoted for certain communities	21
Misrecognition		5
Cultural values (undefined)		4
Burial practices		0
Environmental sustainability (non-recognized)		2
Nonrecognition		2
No recognition		2
Recognition of needs and values		19
Digital access - skills & infrastructure		8
Digital comfort		6

Name	Description	Files
Digital transformation		6
Digital education (not elaborated)		1
Economic & consumer rights		2
Cashless payment		1
Economic participation		1
Free service fee using the natural ecosystem		0
Healthcare		2
intellectual property		1
Jobs		3
Privacy & data protection		6
Protection against 'negative' impacts of digitalization		1

Name	Description	Files
Science and technologies	Related to both infrastructure and expertise	4
Social security & financial aid		1
Financial aid		1
general plight of vulnerable groups		0
Whose needs and values are recognized	Identification of particularly vulnerable communities, whose livelihoods and cultural values maybe affected.	21
Digital talents		3
Ethnic minorities		2
Experts		1
No recognition		2
Person with meritorious services		1
Religious people		0
Specific regions	Geographic, not individual targets	4
Climate vulnerable regions		0

Name	Description	Files
Economically vulnerable regions		0
Rural regions		4
Urban regions		0
The people in general		12
Vulnerable groups (recognition)		2
low income households		0
People loss of civil capacity		0
People under social protection		1
persons with cognitive or behavioral difficulties		1
persons with lost or limited legal capacity		1
Workers		1
Youth,students		8