

Annex

Appendix 1

The Office of the Comptroller General's typology of corruption

Law	Article, Item	Description
8112	117, IX	Taking advantage of your position to obtain private gain (personal or for third parties), damaging the dignity of the public service.
8112	117, XII	Accepting a bribe, commission, gift or advantage of any kind, by virtue of your position.
8112	117, XIII	Accepting a payment, job, or pension from a foreign state.
8112	117, XVI	Using personnel or material resources from the public department in private services or activities.
8112	132, IV	Administrative impropriety.
8112	132, X	'Damaging' public coffers and wasting national assets.
8112	132, XI	Corruption.
4878	43, IX	Accepting bribes, payments, gifts or benefits and personal advantages of any kind and, under any pretext, by virtue of your position.
4878	43, LXI	Giving to a third person, outside the department and in circumstances not established by law, tasks that you or your subordinates were supposed to perform.

Source: Author's based on the CGU's typology (*Relatório de Punição Expulsiva – Dismissal Punishment Report - 2014, 2015, 2016*).

Appendix 2

Types of sanctions enforced against federal civil servants*

Type	Sanctions	Law	Observations
Light	Warning or Suspension	Law nº 8.112/90, all items of article 116; article 117, from item I to VIII and XIX	For less serious offences with minor impacts at work. In general, this sanction applies to behaviours associated with zeal, dedication, hierarchy, discretion, promptness, assiduity, punctuality, as long as the culprit is not a re-offender. Suspension must be applied in the case of repeated offences punished with a warning.
Moderate	Suspension (up to 90 days)	Law nº 8.112/90, article 117, items XVII e XVIII, and article 130	Relates to performing any activity that is incompatible with the exercise of the position and with working hours. When considered convenient, suspensions may be converted into a fine, on the basis of 50% per day of salary or remuneration, and the employee is obliged to remain in service.

Severe	Suspension from 30 to 90 days or Dismissal (<i>demissão</i>) for career civil servant, Demotion (<i>destituição do cargo</i>) of those appointed for special positions and Cancellation of Pension (<i>caçassão de aposentadoria</i>) for those who engaged in malpractice before retirement.	Law nº 8.112/90, articles 117, items IX e XI; and 132, items II, III, V, VI, VII, IX, XII, and item XIII (that encompasses article 117 items from IX to XVI).	The nature and seriousness of the offence, the damage to the public service, the aggravating or attenuating circumstances and the functional background will be considered to impose the sanction. The list of offences includes some corruption charges, according to CGU typology. The culprit is banned from the federal government for five years in cases of using the position for personal or others' benefit and of acting as a representative or intermediary within the federal civil service (article 117, items IX e XI).
Super severe	Dismissal for career civil servant, Demotion of those appointed for special positions and Cancellation of Pension for those who engaged in malpractice before retirement. Punishment also includes lifetime ban from working for the federal government .	Law nº 8.112/90, article 132, items I, IV, VIII, X e XI.	Enforced in serious cases of corruption and correlated crimes such as embezzlement, 'administrative improbity', misappropriation or misapplication of public money.

Source: Author's table based on Law nº 8.112, December 11, 1990.

*Note: Law 4878/1965 regulates the federal police action and also lists offences and sanctions, including items LXI and IX from article 43 that are considered acts of corruption and are among the offences punished with dismissals.

Appendix 3
Information on the interviews and interviewees

ID	Role	Agency	Category	Undergrad education (BA) in Law	Postgrad education	Gender	Date	Method	Duration	Audio
Interviewee 1	Policy enforcer/ Policy designer	CGU	Elite	Yes	Masters in Political Science/PhD Candidate	M	14/03/17	Skype	52 min	Recorded
Interviewee 2	Policy enforcer/ Policy designer	CGU	Elite	Yes	NA	M	20/03/17	Phone	48 min	Recorded
Interviewee 3	Policy enforcer/ Training	SRF	Blue-collar	No	NA	M	27/03/17	Phone	1h 40 min	Recorded
Interviewee 4	Disciplinary investigator/Training	CGU, AGU and other agencies	Blue- collar	Yes	NA	M	27/03/17	Phone	55 min	Not recorded (notes only)
Interviewee 5	Policy enforcer/Policy designer/ Influencer	CGU	Elite	Yes	NA	M	28/03/17	Skype	1h 5min	Recorded
Interviewee 6	Policy enforcer/Policy designer/ Influencer	SRF	Elite	Yes	NA	M	25/04/17	Phone	1h13min	Recorded
Interviewee 7	Policy enforcer/Policy designer/Influencer	CGU, AGU, and other agencies	Former Elite, current Blue- collar	Yes	NA	M	25/04/17	Phone	1h 27min	Recorded
Interviewee 8	Investigator/Ethics Committee	MTE	Blue-collar	Yes	NA	M	Feb-15	Phone	35 min	Recorded
Interviewee 9	Investigator/Ethics Committee	Ancine	Blue-collar	No	NA	M	Feb-15	Phone	20 min	Recorded
Interviewee 10	Policy enforcer/ Policy designer/Influencer	CGU	Elite	Yes	Masters in Law/PhD Candidate	M	23/05/17	Face to face	2h 30 min	Recorded
Interviewee 11	Policy designer/ Influencer	CGU	Elite	Yes	NA	M	01/06/17	Written	NA	NA
Interviewee 12	Policy enforcer/ Policy designer/ Influencer	CGU	Elite	Yes	Masters in Law	M	07/06/17	Face to face	1h 21 min	Recorded
Interviewee 13	Policy enforcer/Policy designer/ Influencer	CGU	Elite	No	NA	F	08/06/17	Face to face	57 min	Recorded
Interviewee 14	Policy enforcer/ Policy designer/ Influencer	CGU	Elite	Yes	Masters in Law	M	08/06/17	Face to face	1h 10 min	Recorded

Interviewee 15	Policy enforcer/ Policy designer/ Influencer	CGU	Elite	Yes	Pre-Masters in Law	F	08/06/17	Face to face	1h 30 min	Recorded
Interviewee 16	Policy enforcer/ Policy designer/ Influencer	CGU	Elite	No	Pre-Masters in Law and in Management	M	12/06/17	Face to face	1h 32 min	Recorded
Interviewee 17	Policy enforcer/ Policy designer/Disciplinary Investigator	PRF, and many other agencies	Blue-collar	Yes	NA	M	12/06/17	Face to face	1h 55 min	Recorded
Interviewee 18	Police enforcer/Disciplinary Investigator	CGU	Elite	Yes	Pre-Masters in Law and in Management	M	12/06/17	Face to face	1h 33min	Recorded
Interviewee 19	Policy enforcer/ Policy designer/Influencer	FUNASA	Elite	Yes	Pre-Masters in Law	M	13/06/17	Face to face	1h 45min	Recorded
Interviewee 20	Policy enforcer/ Policy designer/Influencer	CGU, Planning and Communicati on	Elite	Yes	Pre-Masters	M	14/06/17	Face to face	1h	Recorded
Interviewee 21	Policy enforcer/ Disciplinary Investigator	Communicati on	Blue-collar	Yes	NA	M	14/06/17	Face to face	38min	Recorded
Interviewee 22	Policy enforcer/ Policy designer/ Influencer	PRF	Elite	Yes	NA	M	13/06/17	Face to face	1h 41min	Recorded
Interviewee 23	Policy enforcer/ Policy designer/ Influencer	CGU	Elite	No	Pre-Masters in Law	F	14/06/17	Face to face	1h 35 min	Recorded
Interviewee 24	Policy enforcer/ Influencer	PF	Elite	Yes	NA	M	14/06/17	Face to face	1h	Not recorded (notes only)

Obs: NA = not applicable

Bearing in mind that interviewees' roles might overlap or some participants had different functions at distinct moments of their careers, the sample consisted of 1) *policy designers* (n=16), who created internal disciplinary norms and processes in order to improve the disciplinary measures. Among them, three were part of the first Inspectorate General, established in 2001, and other three were cabinet ministers of the CGU; 2) *policy enforcers* (n=20), workers in sectoral (CGU) and sectional inspectorates (internal affairs units in the governmental bodies) who guarantee the functioning of the disciplinary system by monitoring the procedural flow and the penalties enforced. They could also determine the opening of investigative and punitive procedures; 3) *disciplinary investigators* (n=8), who investigate their peers as members of disciplinary or ethics committees, or who have responsibility for the initial analyses of evidence; 4) *training facilitators* (n=3), which refers to those with experience in training their peers to carry out disciplinary procedures or to understand the civil service code of conduct. *Elite* interviewees are defined in this study as figureheads within the accountability system, such as former ministers or executive secretaries and formal leaders of sectoral or sectional inspectorates; while *blue-collar* interviewees are civil servants who do not occupy positions of trust but simply carry out investigative procedures. It is important to highlight that there are some elite interviewees who had previously occupied blue-collar roles, and vice versa.

Appendix 4

Ministries enforcing punitive measures: size of workforce, wage costs, and number of sanctions enforced (Jan 2003- Dec 2014)

Who Endorsed the Sanction	Size of Workforce		Average Annual Wage Cost		Sanctions resulting in dismissal, demotion or loss of pension**		Other serious misconduct		Corruption		Total
	(Average 2003-2014)		Million BRL* (2003-2014)		2003-2014		Jan 2003-Nov 2014		Jan 2003-Nov 2014		Jan 2003-Nov 2014
Agency/Ministry	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	N
MPS (Social Security)	40,275	7.4	7,147.18	10	1,318	26	174	14	1113	86	1287
MJ (Justice)	28,475	5.23	5,118.38	7	809	16	170	22	601	78	771
MEC (Education)	202,502	37.2	20,001.82	27	801	16	620	81	146	19	766
MS (Health)	102,961	18.9	9,990.38	13	541	11	229	46	274	54	503
MF (Finance)	31,480	5.78	10,492.15	14	551	11	84	15	480	85	564
MMA (Environment)	8,983	1.65	901.04	1	213	4	12	6	194	94	206
MTE (Labour & Employment)	7,941	1.46	1,934.10	3	150	3	20	14	126	86	146
MPOG (Planning)	31,573	5.8	2,320.07	3	126	2	36	44	45	56	81
MAPA (Agriculture)	11,387	2.09	2,071.45	3	110	2	20	21	75	79	95
MT (Transportation)	5,322	0.98	2,538.15	3	101	2	28	42	39	58	67
MDA (Agrarian Development)	6,206	1.14	675.92	0	81	2	17	22	60	78	77
MD (Defence)	26,450	4.86	3,119.27	4	57	1	41	79	11	21	52
MME (Mining & Energy)	2,910	0.53	391.94	1	45	1	16	31	35	69	51
AGU (Office of the General Attorney)	7,630	1.4	1,442.17	2	47	1	20	25	60	75	80
MDIC (Industry, Commerce & Foreign Trade)	2,824	0.52	358.2	0	42	1	10	45	12	55	22

PR/CGU/ABIN (Office of the President, Comptroller General, Intelligence Agency)	6,572	1.21	849.18	1	34	1	47	28	119	71.69	166
MINC (Culture)	3,185	0.59	292.65	0	32	1	12	44	15	56	27
MI (National Integration)	2,777	0.51	524.19	1	19	0	4	31	9	69	13
MC (Communications)	2,078	0.38	995.88	1	19	0	2	33	4	67	6
MCTI (Science & Technology)	7,068	1.3	1,086.67	1	8	0	6	60	4	40	10
MCID (Cities)	447	0.08	25.43	0	6	0	4	100		0	4
MPA (Fishing & Aquaculture)	586	0.11	12.18	0	5	0	2	100	0	0	2
ME (Sports)	296	0.05	17.98	0	3	0	0	0	3	100	3
MTUR (Tourism)	414	0.08	40.18	0	6	0	2	67	1	33	3
MRE (Foreign Relations)	3,401	0.62	403.03	1	1	0	0	0	1	100	1
MDS (Social Development)	642	0.12	29.56	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Observations (Total)	544,385	100	74,599.61	100	5,125	100		1576		3427	5003***

Source: CGU (*Relatório de Punições Expulsivas 2003-2014*) and Ministry of Planning (*Boletim Estatístico de Pessoal bol237_jan2016*) * Brazilian reais; **Enforced against all misconduct (both corruption and other serious offences)

***NA: n=5,003 with 2 missing-values

